



STATE OF MICHIGAN
STATE 9-1-1 COMMITTEE
LANSING

RICK SNYDER
GOVERNOR

SHERIFF DALE GRIBLER
CHAIR

November 2, 2012

Mr. James Fyvie
Clinton County E-911 Central Dispatch
100 East State Street, Suite 1400
St. Johns, Michigan 48879

Dear Mr. Fyvie:

Enclosed is a signed copy of the final report of the 9-1-1 Compliance Review of Clinton County. This review was approved by the State 9-1-1 Committee (SNC) on October 2, 2012.

Based on the information that was supplied to the review team, the overall final findings of Clinton County's 9-1-1 operations are functionally in compliance with the requirements of PA 32 (as amended) at this time.

Thank you for your assistance during this review. Please express our gratitude to the employees of Clinton County for their cooperation and assistance during the review period, and for the service they provide to citizens and visitors of Clinton County through a quality 9-1-1 program. If you have any questions regarding this report or any other issues, please feel free to contact me at (517) 241-0111.

Sincerely,

Lori L. Howard
Compliance Review Analyst
State 9-1-1 Office

Enclosures

cc: Sheriff Wayne Kangas
Clinton County Sheriff's Office

Mr. Larry Martin
Clinton County Board of Commissioners

ASSOCIATION OF PUBLIC SAFETY COMMUNICATIONS OFFICIALS • COMMERCIAL MOBILE RADIO SERVICE • DEPARTMENT OF LICENSING AND REGULATORY AFFAIRS • DEPARTMENT OF STATE POLICE • DEPUTY SHERIFF'S ASSOCIATION • FRATERNAL ORDER OF POLICE • MICHIGAN ASSOCIATION OF AMBULANCE SERVICES • MICHIGAN ASSOCIATION OF CHIEFS OF POLICE • MICHIGAN ASSOCIATION OF COUNTIES • MICHIGAN COMMUNICATIONS DIRECTORS ASSOCIATION • MICHIGAN ASSOCIATION OF FIRE CHIEFS • MICHIGAN PROFESSIONAL FIREFIGHTERS UNION • MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION • MICHIGAN SHERIFF'S ASSOCIATION • MICHIGAN STATE POLICE TROOPERS ASSOCIATION • NATIONAL EMERGENCY NUMBER ASSOCIATION • TELECOMMUNICATIONS ASSOCIATION OF MICHIGAN • UPPER PENINSULA EMERGENCY MEDICAL SERVICES • MEMBERS OF THE GENERAL PUBLIC APPOINTED BY THE GOVERNOR, SPEAKER OF THE HOUSE, AND MAJORITY LEADER OF THE SENATE

Clinton County Compliance Review Final Report

At its March 2003 meeting, the State 9-1-1 Committee (SNC) voted to conduct random compliance reviews of 9-1-1 expenditures of Michigan counties. These reviews would be for expenditures of funds generated through the provisions of the amended 9-1-1 Act, Public Act No. 32 of 1986. County 9-1-1 revenues include wireless revenues distributed to counties through the State 9-1-1 Fund, revenues collected through county 9-1-1 surcharges on landline phones, and dispatcher training funds distributed to primary public safety answering points (PSAPs).

The request for a compliance review of Clinton County was received by the State 9-1-1 Administrator's Office on November 28, 2011. The request was approved by the SNC at its regular meeting on December 13, 2011. Certification subcommittee members Mr. Greg Clark, Mr. Rich Feole, Ms. Lori Howard, Mr. Steve Leese, Mr. Barry Nelson, and Mr. Dave Piasecki were named to the Clinton County Compliance Review Team, with Mr. Tim Smith shadowing for his first review. The years 2009, 2010, and 2011 were chosen as the time period for the focus of the review.

On December 13, 2011, a letter advising Clinton County of the review was sent to Mr. James Fyvie, Director of Clinton County Central Dispatch (CCCD). The letter requested the following information from Clinton County:

- The Clinton County 9-1-1 plan (and any amendments)
- Copy of the most current policies and procedures for the Clinton County Central Dispatch
- Copy of wireless training funds, revenue journal entries and expenditures, and completed State 9-1-1 Committee 510s from 2007 to date
- Copies of the independent audits for 2008, 2009, and 2010 (and 2011, if available) for the funds collected under P.A. No. 32
- Name of a contact person to serve as a coordinator for this review

In addition, CCCD was requested to complete the "Pre-Compliance Review Information Request" and Financial Reports for 2009, 2010, and 2011. The requested information was received by the State 9-1-1 Administrator's Office in a timely and organized manner. Mr. James Fyvie was designated as the contact person for the review.

Background

Clinton County Central Dispatch serves Clinton County. Clinton County implemented Enhanced 9-1-1 in April 1993 and Phase II wireless 9-1-1 was deployed in 2003. CCCD began receiving VoIP calls in 2006. CCCD dispatches for nine police departments:

Bath Township Police Department	Elsie Police Department
Capital Region International Airport	Michigan State Police – Post 11
Clinton County Sheriff Department	Ovid Police Department
Dewitt City Police Department	St. Johns Police Department
Dewitt Township Police Department	

CCCD dispatches or receives requests within Clinton County for seven EMS/Ambulance Services:

Clinton Area Ambulance	Lansing Mercy Ambulance
Delta Township Ambulance	Ovid Ambulance
Elsie Ambulance	Portland Ambulance
Grand Ledge Ambulance	

CCCD dispatches or receives requests within Clinton County for fourteen fire departments:

Bath Township Fire Department	Elsie Fire Department
Capital Region International Airport	Hubbardston Fire Department
Clinton Area Fire Department	Maple Rapids Fire Department
Dallas Township Fire Department	Ovid Fire Department
Delta Township Fire Department, Station 2	Pewamo Fire Department
Dewitt Area Fire Department	St. Johns Fire Department
Dewitt Township Fire Department	Westphalia Fire Department

In 2011, CCCD received an estimated 17,587 landline 9-1-1 calls and 19,897 wireless 9-1-1 calls (which also includes VoIP calls). In addition, 37,507 non-911 calls were answered by CCCD in 2011.

CCCD takes all wireless and landline calls for police, fire, medical, and animal control for Clinton County, except for landline calls within the annexed area of East Lansing. Closest car is done for both emergency and non-emergency law enforcement calls utilizing AVL (Automatic Vehicle Locators).

CCCD has emergency back-up equipment in place for call re-routing, which currently re-directs Frontier calls to Shiawassee County and AT&T calls to Eaton County. There is a consolidated phone project underway with the counties of Clinton, Eaton, Ingham, and Livingston (CEIL) that should make call re-routing easier for all four counties, as they will back up each other. Upon completion of this network, all calls from Clinton County will be re-routed to Eaton County Central Dispatch.

There is UPS emergency back-up equipment in place, which is separate for radios and the rest of the system. Tower sites have UPS and generator back-up power on LP, and generators are tested weekly. Tower sites are security monitored with read-outs displayed at all dispatch consoles for intruder, generator start-up, and generator low oil/fuel.

Language Line is used for interpreter services and TTY calls are available at each dispatcher position. For recording and playback, Audiolog is used and all calls are recorded and kept for one year and one day. Instant playback is available at each dispatcher position.

There are seven consoles; five are currently working and two were being upgraded as part of the CEIL project at the time of the site review. These additional consoles will have the ability to accommodate dispatchers from other centers who can log into their networks from CCCD. The consoles are arranged in a horseshoe shape with five side-by-side monitors. Phase II mapping is integrated into the CAD system. The CAD vendor is SunGard/OSSI.

State and local 9-1-1 surcharge monies provide the revenue for CCCD's operational costs. The current local surcharge is \$2.76, which includes a county operational surcharge of \$2.25 and a technical surcharge of \$.51, effective July 1, 2011.

Review Process

On June 6, 2012, the members of the Clinton County compliance review team held a pre-review meeting. There were no specific questions that needed to be addressed during this meeting, other than issues that were encountered as Clinton County is the first to complete the financial worksheets.

Site Visit

The site visit and review of CCCD was held on June 27, 2012. The review team met with CCCD Director Jim Fyvie and his secretary, Ms. Diane Kirkpatrick. The accountant, Ms. Cindy Moser, was on call throughout the visit and came in for a short time to answer some questions.

The center has an inclusive Policies and Procedures Manual, containing all policies listed on the review questionnaire. A hard copy of the policies and procedures is available in the middle of the dispatch center, on a rotating shelf within reach of each dispatcher. In addition, each dispatcher's personal copy is available at his/her work area and there is a master copy available at the secretary's desk.

The center staff consists of 17 people: 3 administrative/tech support, 4 supervisors, and 10 dispatchers. Administrative positions include one full-time director, a part-time secretary (30 hours per week), and a part-time IT position for mapping and technology (8 hours per week).

Dispatchers work 12-hour shifts, 6:00-6:00, and have a half hour lunch period. There are three dispatchers on duty at all times, one of whom is a supervisor. Minimum staffing level is two.

The primary duties of dispatchers are call-taking and dispatching. The only other duty that dispatchers perform is opening the courthouse sally port for police. There are large monitors on the wall in the dispatch center to view each sally port.

The dispatch center is located on the first floor of the Clinton County Courthouse. The main entrance is within the courthouse and there is an outside entrance that comes directly into the operations center. Both are locked with buzzers for non-911 entry, and security cameras cover the direct entrance so staff members can see who is at the door before opening it.

The dispatch center shares the building with several other county entities, but utilities and phones are separately maintained. Indirect costs are calculated annually and paid quarterly to the county for space and proportional share of utilities. The main area occupied by the CCCD is approximately 600 square feet, which includes the operations center, two offices, bathroom with shower and employee lockers, and a full kitchen. The full kitchen contains a refrigerator, sink, stove, dishwasher, microwave, coffee maker, table, and chairs. In addition to the area included above, there is an equipment room off the operations center, a radio room in the Mezzanine level of the building, a computer room in the basement, and a large storage room off the office area.

Meeting with Dispatchers

Discussions were held with the dispatchers on duty: Angie Beals and Linda Epkey. The supervisor on duty was Ross Lauback.

Angie Beals explained the functions of each screen, including how dispatchers can message officers in their cars. Dispatchers use EMD Protocol or medical calls and Rip and Run dispatching for fire and EMS departments. They are familiar with Phase 1, Phase II, VOIP, and rebid. CAD (OSSI) and mapping are used.

Dispatchers advised that along with their main dispatch duties, occasionally they are called to open the sally port for police. This is usually for prisoner transport to the upstairs courtrooms, where there are holding cells. One of the dispatchers on duty demonstrated opening the sally port during the visit, which is accomplished from an icon on the radio's touch screens.

Meeting with Local Police and Fire Chiefs

The following local representatives made themselves available to the review team:

Mr. Lynn Weber – Clinton Area Ambulance Director and President of the Administrative Policy Board

Mr. Dennis Palmer – Mercy Ambulance (private service)

Chief Mike Madden – St. Johns Police Department

Capt. Eric Brown – Ovid Fire and Ambulance

Lt. Kyle Bowman – MSP Post 11

Chief Larry Jerue – City of Dewitt Police Department

Mr. Jeremy Sodman – Elsie Area Ambulance

Capt. Mike Vetter – Clinton County Sheriff's Office

There is an obvious positive feeling from these representatives about their interaction with Clinton County Central Dispatch. It is clear that they will miss Director Fyvie when he retires at the end of the year, but expressed their sincere appreciation for his dedication and professionalism.

Initially, just the two ambulance service representatives were present and the conversation centered on ambulance services. Mr. Palmer stated that the dispatch personnel are great and he has no problems with them, but discussed the "gray areas" for private companies to get grant funding and how it differs by county. He would like to see a "closest car concept" used for ambulance services in the same way that it is used by fire and law enforcement.

Mr. Weber stated that he has worked with two other counties, and prefers working with Clinton County more than the other two. Any time that there has been an issue with a dispatcher, he and Director Fyvie have communicated openly and quickly resolved the issue. When asked about any funding issues, Mr. Weber stated that although there is good funding, he is not sure that AVL is worth the cost.

Chief Jerue spoke highly of Clinton County Dispatch, regarding how they handle calls, but would like better equipment. He was not specific about what equipment, but stated that he realizes that there are economic issues everywhere.

Chief Madden pointed out what a perfectionist Director Fyvie is, but he believes that it takes too long to train dispatchers. The review team explained that with the new standards being adopted for dispatcher training, all dispatchers will have minimum requirements for training.

Capt. Brown prefers working in Clinton County over Shiawassee County because Shiawassee uses the state radio system, which does not always work in Ovid. He claims that Ovid has spotty radio coverage because it “sits in a hole” topographically.

Lt. Bowman is grateful for the patch and claims that all of the State Police enjoy working in Clinton County because all law enforcement entities get along. Capt. Vetter agreed that there will always be personality issues among individuals, but he believes that all law enforcement works well together to get the job done. He stated that there is good communication, cooperation, and trust, and that safety is the biggest priority.

Examples of incidents were given where Central Dispatch provided cooperation in handling situations, keeping everyone calm and providing direction. One incident originated as a “Breaking and Entering,” but escalated into a domestic dispute where a Dewitt Police officer was shot. Although the dispatcher handling the call has a close friendship with the officer, she remained calm and was able to handle the situation with impressive professionalism despite her concerns for her friend. In the situation where an apartment complex caught fire and approximately 50 people were involved, multiple units of every type were needed and it was necessary to use nearly all resources available. Dispatchers performed well under pressure and units coordinated services with each other. Other incidents include a collision between a fire truck and an ambulance, and saving a suicidal teenager.

The normal population for Clinton County is just over 75,000, with a slight increase during special events such as the Mint Festival, Ox Roast, and Elsie Dairy Days.

Clinton County Central Dispatch Fiscal Summary

Revenue for the dispatch center comes from state and county surcharge funds.

Annual Operating Budget for Fiscal Year 2011	=	\$2,341,668.97
State 9-1-1 Fund Receipts	=	\$ 213,329.00
County Surcharge Receipts	=	\$1,863,815.61
Other Receipts	=	\$ 264,524.36
Annual Operating Budget for Fiscal Year 2010	=	\$2,029,722.16
State 9-1-1 Fund Receipts	=	\$ 199,915.00
County Surcharge Receipts	=	\$1,740,626.94
Other Receipts	=	\$ 89,180.22
Annual Operating Budget for Fiscal Year 2009	=	\$2,037,043.10
State 9-1-1 Fund Receipts	=	\$ 196,177.00
County Surcharge Receipts	=	\$1,745,119.48
Other Receipts	=	\$ 95,746.62

Local 9-1-1 Surcharge

The current local surcharge is \$2.76, which includes a county surcharge of \$2.25 and a technical surcharge of \$.51, effective July 1, 2011.

State 9-1-1 Funds

State 9-1-1 funds are remitted into account number 2610107 672020 and county surcharge funds are remitted into account number 2610107 672010.

Training Funds

Dispatch Training funds are remitted into account number 2610107 672030.

Mr. Jim Fyvie turned in the necessary documentation within the required timeframe. Clinton County Central Dispatch is compliant with the requirements of the Dispatcher Training Fund.

Training Fund Distribution 2007 = \$10,363.00
Training Fund Distribution 2008 = \$10,552.00
Training Fund Distribution 2009 = \$14,706.00
Training Fund Distribution 2010 = \$13,509.00
Training Fund Distribution 2011 = \$14,476.00
Total = \$63,606.00

Training Fund Expenditures 2007 = \$10,363.00
Training Fund Expenditures 2008 = \$10,552.00
Training Fund Expenditures 2009 = \$14,706.00
Training Fund Expenditures 2010 = \$13,509.00
Training Fund Expenditures 2011 = \$14,126.91
Total = \$63,256.91

Remaining funds to spend: = \$349.09

Findings and Final Summary

The Clinton County 9-1-1 Plan was first enacted in July 1991 and modified in December 1993 and again in April 2000. The plan is current and in compliance with P.A. No. 32.

Clinton County's 9-1-1 board meets quarterly and minutes are taken. There is an Administrative Policy Board that makes recommendations to the CCCD Director and the County Board of Commissioners, and a Technical Advisory Committee that reports to the Administrative Policy Board. The main purpose of the Technical Advisory Committee is to recommend policy and procedures to the Administrative Policy Board, concentrating on technical operating procedures.

The staff members of CCCD are highly respected and valued by the emergency response departments served. CCCD provides an effective 9-1-1 system and prioritizes funds appropriately according to the revenue available to them. There are no required or recommended actions at this time.

In closing, based upon the documentation requested, made available to, and reviewed by the committee, Clinton County and its 9-1-1 operations are functionally and fiscally in compliance with the requirements of P. A. No. 32 (as amended) at this time.

Submitted on July 27, 2012, by:


Mr. Greg Clark


Mr. Rich Feole


Ms. Lori Howard


Mr. Steve Leese


Mr. Barry Nelson


Mr. Dave Piasecki


Mr. Tim Smith