

CLINTON COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

COURTHOUSE
100 E. STATE STREET
ST. JOHNS, MICHIGAN 48879-1571
989-224-5120



Chairperson
Robert Showers
Vice-Chairperson
Kenneth B. Mitchell
Members
Valerie Vail-Shirey
David W. Pohl
Bruce DeLong
John Andrews
Dwight Washington

Administrator/Controller
John F. Fuentes
Clerk of the Board
Debra A. Sutherland

DATE 07/25/2023 The Clinton County Board of Commissioners met on Tuesday, July 25, 2023 at 9:00 a.m. with Chairperson Robert Showers presiding.

MOMENT OF SILENCE AND PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE Chairperson Showers called for a moment of silence. The pledge of allegiance was given to the flag of the United States of America.

ROLL CALL Roll was called with a quorum of the members in attendance: Val Vail-Shirey, David Pohl, Bruce DeLong, Kenneth B. Mitchell, Robert Showers, John Andrews and Dwight Washington.

COUNTY PERSONNEL John Fuentes, Todd Campbell, Steve Wiswasser, Brenda Speers, Brenda Young, Sherry Loynes and Becky Fike

VISITORS Janine Dyer, Chris A. Bouck, Lisa Boling, Fred Boling, Dennis Strahle, Scott Koenigskecht, Melany Mack, Rob Mack, Kelly Schafer, Kathy Dickson, Amy Kerr, Linda Pung, Paula Allen, Corissa Harris, Laurie Briggs-Dudley and Mary Beth Elstro

AGENDA The agenda was amended to move the following item(s):
 • Retirement recognition before public comments

 BOARD ACTION: Commissioner Washington moved, seconded by Commissioner Mitchell to approve the agenda as amended. Motion carried.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES The June 27, 2023 minutes were presented for review and approval.

 BOARD ACTION: Commissioner DeLong moved, seconded by Commissioner Pohl to approve the minutes as printed. Motion carried.

COMMUNICATIONS The following communications were received:
 1. Alcona County Resolution Supporting The Revised School Code HB 4672
 2. Alger County Resolution Affirming Support of all Constitutional Rights
 3. Alger County Resolution in Support of The Revised School Code HB 4672
 4. Alger County Resolution Opposing Legislation Preempting Local Control Michigan House Bills 4526-4528
 5. Cheboygan County Sanitary Code Resolution No. 2023-100001
 6. Delta County Resolution for the Opposing of Proposed Changes to the Statewide Septic Code
 7. Delta County Resolution Reaffirming Delta County to be a Second Amendment Sanctuary County
 8. St. Joseph County Resolution Supporting Second Amendment of the US Constitution

BOARD ACTION: Commissioner Washington moved, seconded by Commissioner Pohl to acknowledge receipt of the communications. Motion carried.

ADMINISTRATOR/
CONTROLLER'S REPORT

John Fuentes, County Administrator/Controller reported that he has followed up with Mr. Boling following his comments at the last Board of Commissioner's meeting regarding a noise and barking dog issue in his neighborhood. He has received information from other departments and will be completing a thorough review.

BRENDA YOUNG
PROSECUTOR'S OFFICE
RETIREMENT
RECOGNITION

Chairperson Showers presented Brenda Young with a plaque of recognition for over 35 years of dedicated service to Clinton County, the last 15 years in the Prosecuting Attorney's Office. Chairperson Showers noted Ms. Young's kind, friendly personality and how she will be greatly missed in the building.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Chairperson Showers called for public comments.

- Fred Boling, 8526 E. Cutler Road, Bath, spoke of his continued frustration and efforts regarding the barking dogs in his neighborhood. Mr. Boling requested help from the members to stop the noise.
- Scott Koenigsnecht, 4334 N. Wacousta Road, Fowler, introduced himself as the new Clinton County RESA Superintendent.
- Dennis Strahle, 12833 W. Clark Road, Eagle Township, reported that the Eagle Township Board selected individuals to serve on the Eagle Township Planning Commission, and Laurie Briggs-Dudley, Eagle Township Clerk, announced the names.

MID-MICHIGAN DISTRICT
HEALTH DEPARTMENT

Liz Braddock, Mid-Michigan District Health Department, submitted a written report which was included in the meeting packet.

APPROVAL OF
COMMISSIONERS'
EXPENSE ACCOUNTS

Commissioners' expense accounts were presented for review and approval.

BOARD ACTION: Commissioner DeLong moved, seconded by Commissioner Pohl to approve the expense accounts, subject to review by the Chair and Clerk. Motion carried.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

The following are reports of Committee meetings:

**WAYS AND MEANS
COMMITTEE MEETING**

Commissioner DeLong, Chairperson of the Ways and Means Committee, reported on a meeting held July 13, 2023.

ATTENDANCE AT
COMMITTEE MEETING

Members Present:

Bruce DeLong, W&M Committee Chairperson
David Pohl
Dwight Washington
John Andrews
Val Vail-Shirey
Ken Mitchell
Robert Showers, Ex-Officio Member

Staff Present:

John Fuentes
Todd Campbell
Cindy Moser
Brenda Speers
Tony Spagnuolo
Penny Goerge

Others Present:

Janine Dyer, Eagle Township
Adam Smiddy, Managing Consultant, Guidehouse
David Sernick, Managing Consultant, Guidehouse
Claire Wilke, Senior Consultant, Guidehouse
Adam North, Visiting Fellow, Guidehouse
M.D. Smith, Lansing State Journal
Nicole Fickes, Victor Township

CALL TO ORDER/APPROVAL
OF AGENDA

1. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. Commissioner Washington moved, seconded by Commissioner Pohl, to approve the agenda. Motion carried.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

2. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong requested limited public comments. There were none.

GUIDEHOUSE

3.

BUSINESS NEEDS STUDY
FOR PROSECUTOR'S
OFFICE

- A. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong introduced Administrator/Controller Fuentes to discuss the business assessment that was conducted by an independent source (Guidehouse) to provide an understanding of the current budgetary and operational constraints and opportunities within the Prosecuting Attorney's Office.
- Administrator/Controller Fuentes introduced Adam North, David Sernick and Claire Wilke from Guidehouse to provide a summary of their findings, discuss recommendations, and answer questions;
 - During the assessment, interviews took place with Attorneys and Staff in the Prosecutor's Office, Court Administrator/Magistrate and Judge, Clinton County Indigent Defense Administrator, Law Enforcement Officials, and the Clinton County Prosecutor;
 - Data was gathered from a variety of sources including the Prosecuting Attorneys Association of Michigan, RAND Corporation's Indigent Defense Report, the Michigan Department of Management and Budget, the Michigan Supreme Court, and individual county budgets from Eaton and Shiawassee Counties for benchmarking purposes;
 - The Guidehouse Team explained that an understaffed office due to vacancies and ongoing turnover (since 2021) is the core challenge that has led to a continuous spiral of overworked employees who end up leaving due to work/life balance; as a result, external relationships are strained, and lack of trust has added stress and friction to the system; furthermore, technological, process, and staffing changes have multiplied the department challenges;
 - It was also noted that the budget has not kept up with inflation, and the budget is lower than benchmarked counties (Shiawassee and Eaton);
 - The assessment identifies operational, administrative, and budgetary recommendations:
 - 1. Operational recommendations were discussed and will be considered and implemented at the discretion of the Prosecuting Attorney;
 - 2. Administrative recommendations will be considered as either stand-alone items, to the extent they may only affect the Prosecuting Attorney's Office or in conjunction with broader administrative changes that affect all County operations;

3. The budgetary recommendations from the report are summarized below:
 - a. Increasing each attorney position by \$10,000 to become increasingly competitive with state and private agencies;
 - b. Offering \$5,000 signing bonuses to new hires;
 - c. Increasing the number of steps within a salaried position may have a positive psychological effect to keep employees within a position, seeking subsequent step raises;
 - d. Increasing annual budgets to account for inflation and employee compensation;
 - e. The addition of one full-time discovery-specific employee, responsible for the technical aspects of discovery accumulation and distribution, establishment of standard operating procedures, and cross-training office staff.
- Administration has reviewed the budgetary recommendations contained within the report and recommends the actions below for implementation:
 1. Adjustments to the approved salary scale for the Assistant Prosecuting Attorney and Chief Assistant Prosecuting Attorney classifications as follows:

	Hire	1 Year	2 Year	3 Year	4 Year
Assistant Prosecutor	79,891	83,385	87,054	90,908	94,952
Chief Assistant Prosecutor	91,674	95,757	100,045	104,547	109,274

2. Implement a one-time hiring incentive for Assistant Prosecuting Attorneys in the amount of \$5,000, payable 50% after the completion of six months of employment and 50% after the completion of one year of employment, until the office is fully staffed. Evaluate the need to consider continuation in the future based on labor market.
 3. Implement a one-time retention incentive for current Assistant Prosecuting Attorneys in the amount of \$5,000 and \$2,500 for current Prosecuting Attorney support personnel, payable 50% upon approval and 50% six months from date of approval, until the office is fully staffed. Evaluate the need to consider continuation in the future based on labor market.
 4. Authorize the creation of a "Discovery Technician" position at Grade 06 of the current classification system (range \$42,440 to \$50,943).
 5. The report did not include a recommendation for additional Assistant Prosecuting Attorney positions, based on current caseload statistics, however it recognizes that changes have occurred, and the impact of these changes continue to have an adverse effect that may result in the need in the immediate future; therefore, in recognition of the uncertainty related to the impact of these changes Administration also recommends that one (1) additional Assistant Prosecuting Attorney position be added to the Position Allocation List and initiate the process to begin the recruiting process at this time.
- Prosecutor Spagnuolo provided comments regarding the assessment noting he has confidence in the report and he emphasized that if the Board approves Administration's recommendations, this will be a huge step forward for his office in terms of providing public safety and service, and protecting the citizens in accordance with the law; Prosecutor Spagnuolo also welcomes continuing education opportunities such as the leadership training that is recommended in the assessment, but to do that, he needs enough staffing first;

- The Prosecutor’s Office Manager, Brenda Speers spoke regarding the staffing struggles for support personnel, as her office has spent a significant amount of time going through the application and interview process with several candidates; current employers of applicants seem to be offering higher salaries for their employee to stay in their current positions; she is hoping the County’s incentives will assist them with filling these positions and ultimately save the County time and money;
- Administrator/Controller Fuentes emphasized that there are at least 20 other County Prosecutors attempting to fill positions throughout the State of Michigan; discussion has already begun about taking additional measures and utilizing specialized resources to fill these positions if necessary;
- The Guidehouse Team addressed questions from the Commissioners and emphasized the importance of work/life balance;
- Discussion took place regarding the financial implications of the recommended actions; it is estimated that the recommended changes will add roughly \$300,000 to the Prosecutor’s annual budget, the Guidehouse Team noted this is consistent with their recommendation relative to the budget related inflation and will level Clinton County with the benchmarked counties on a per capita basis;
- The Commissioners recognized the Guidehouse Team for their fine work on this report.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Commissioner Mitchell moved, seconded by Commissioner Vail-Shirey, to **recommend** authorizing the following:

1. Adjustments to the approved salary scale for the Assistant Prosecuting Attorney and Chief Assistant Prosecuting Attorney classifications as follows:

	Hire	1 Year	2 Year	3 Year	4 Year
Assistant Prosecutor	79,891	83,385	87,054	90,908	94,952
Chief Asst Prosecutor	91,674	95,757	100,045	104,547	109,274

2. Implement a one-time hiring incentive for Assistant Prosecuting Attorneys in the amount of \$5,000, payable 50% after the completion of six months of employment and 50% after the completion of one year of employment, until the office is fully staffed.
3. Implement a one-time retention incentive for current Assistant Prosecuting Attorneys in the amount of \$5,000 and \$2,500 for current Prosecuting Attorney support personnel, payable 50% upon approval and 50% six months from date of approval, until the office is fully staffed.
4. Authorize the creation of a “Discovery Technician” position at Grade 06 of the current classification system (range \$42,440 to \$50,943).
5. Authorize one (1) additional Assistant Prosecuting Attorney position be added to the Position Allocation List and initiate the process to begin the recruiting process.

Motion carried.

BOARD ACTION: Commissioner DeLong moved, seconded by Commissioner Andrews to concur with the committee recommendation. Voting on the motion by roll call vote, those voting aye were DeLong, Andrews, Washington, Vail-Shirey, Pohl, Mitchell and Showers. Seven ayes, zero nays. Motion carried.

BROADBAND UPDATE

- B. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong introduced discussion regarding the County’s broadband efforts.
 - Adam Smiddy from Guidehouse provided the members with the ROBIN Application Scoring Summary:
 - Clinton County’s application missed by 3.5 points with a score of 197; 200.5 was the cut off for funding;
 - A large portion of proposed locations were considered “underserved” or “served” resulting in a loss of points;
 - Clinton County does not have opportunity zones that were part of the application;
 - Matching dollars were heavily weighted and should be maximized moving forward;
 - Administrator/Controller Fuentes expressed his disappointment that Frontier was unable to increase its financial commitment during the final stages of the application development, as the percentage of its contribution to a different application was greater than that included in Clinton County’s application;
 - Discussion followed regarding the State’s allocation of \$1.6 billion for future BEAD (Broadband Access, Equity and Deployment) grant funding; the County will be able to take everything learned from the ROBIN Grant application process and apply this knowledge and expertise toward future grant funding applications.

No action required.

COMMISSIONERS’ COMMENTS

- 4. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong requested Commissioners comments.
 - Commissioner Showers provided an update on behalf of the Capitol Council of Governments regarding road projects;
 - Commissioner Washington provided an update on behalf of DHHS;
 - Commissioner Andrews briefed the members regarding a recent MDOT meeting he attended.

ADMINISTRATOR’S REPORT

- 5. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong requested the administrator’s report from Administrator/Controller Fuentes.
 - Administrator/Controller Fuentes notified the members that he and Deputy Administrator Campbell recently met with the new City Manager from St. Johns;
 - In reference to Guidehouse’s business needs study, Administrator/Controller Fuentes noted there are additional recommendations from Guidehouse that will be taken into consideration as part of the salary and classification study that will take place for all county employees later this year to maintain the integrity of the overall system.

ADJOURNMENT OF COMMITTEE MEETING

- 6. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong adjourned the meeting at 10:24 a.m.

WAYS AND MEANS COMMITTEE MEETING

Commissioner DeLong, Chairperson of the Ways and Means Committee, reported on a meeting held July 20, 2023.

ATTENDANCE AT COMMITTEE MEETING

Members Present:
 Bruce DeLong, W&M Committee Chairperson
 David Pohl
 Dwight Washington
 John Andrews
 Ken Mitchell
 Val Vail-Shirey
 Robert Showers, Ex-Officio Member

Staff Present:

Todd Campbell	Penny Goerge
Cindy Moser	Rob Wooten
Tom Helms	Kate Neese
Chris Collom	Sheriff Dush
Undersheriff Gute	Corissa Harris
Bill Hendrian	Sherry Loynes
Nikki Maneval	Tina Weber
Terri Paradise	Theresa Nelson
Debi Price	Erica Denman
Deb Sutherland	

Others Present:

Janine Dyer, Eagle Township
MaLissa Schutt, Clinton Transit
Gail Watkins, Clinton Transit
Jack Phillips, Clinton Transit

CALL TO ORDER/APPROVAL
OF AGENDA

1. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. Commissioner Washington moved, seconded by Commissioner Mitchell, to approve the agenda as amended. Motion carried.
 - Deletion - Access/Policies & Procedures for Clinton County Properties – Agenda Item #6
 - Addition to Agenda - Sheriff's Office Inmate Communications Contract – Agenda Item #4A

PUBLIC COMMENTS

2. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong requested limited public comments.
 - Bill Hendrian, MSU Director, introduced himself to the members.

CLINTON TRANSIT
ARTICLES OF
INCORPORATION UPDATE

3. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong introduced MaLissa Schutt, Executive Director and Gail Watkins, Chairperson from Clinton Transit to discuss proposed updates to Clinton Transit's Articles of Incorporation.
 - Mr. Wakins discussed the significant improvements that have been made to Clinton Area Transit System's infrastructure, personnel, and service in the past four years; he explained the Clinton Transit Board of Directors continue to set the strategic direction of the agency and have surpassed their pre-pandemic ridership by nearly 40%;
 - As Clinton Transit looks into the future, the Transit Board of Directors is proposing the following updates to the Articles of Incorporation:
 - Article III – Exception of services for the area in the jurisdictional limits of the City of East Lansing to align with PA 195 of 1986;
 - Article IV, Section 5 – Proposed update to the maximum allowable mills from one to five to align with PA 196 of 1986;
 - Article V – Sections 2,3,5 and 7 – Add monthly compensation, outline procedures for dismissal of members who fail to adhere to the agency's roles and responsibilities and remove the Board of Commissioners' approval of by-laws and operating budget.
 - Discussion took place about how the East Lansing residents, that reside in Clinton County will be affected by the proposed jurisdictional amendment to the Articles:
 - Mr. Watkins stated that East Lansing is under the CATA millage and should not be part of Clinton Transit's service area as they pay no millage to Clinton Transit;

- Discussion followed and Commissioner Andrews emphasized that if this amendment is approved, he wants to be sure alternative solutions are provided for these residents and they are notified in a timely manner; Ms. Schutt assured the members they will address the situation delicately;
- The members discussed the proposed monthly compensation:
 - Ms. Schutt discussed the level of success the Clinton Transit Board has seen as result of becoming more involved and invested in the community; she believes they are setting a new standard in advocating for the agency and community as they help carry out their vision;
 - Commissioner Vail-Shirey expressed concerns regarding other boards and agencies not receiving similar compensation; she wants to provide the same ability across the board;
 - Commissioner Showers emphasized that the Road Commission and Clinton Transit are different from the other county boards and agencies, as they are chartered under statutes that do not provide county tax dollars; the compensation would be paid from Clinton Transit's millage, just as the Road Commission compensation is paid from their own budget that is funded primarily through the Michigan gas tax proceeds;
- Discussion took place regarding a change in the level of oversight provided by the Board of Commissioners in the amended Articles:
 - The proposed amendments provide the Clinton Transit's Board Chairperson with a procedure for dismissal of members who fail to adhere to the agency's roles and responsibilities;
 - Mr. Watkins emphasized that the Board of Commissioners will still appoint the Clinton Transit Board Members;
 - Commissioner Showers stated the Board Liaison will be involved and provide oversight;
 - Commissioner Pohl noted that the Board of Commissioners is required to approve any millage renewals which would provide recourse if performance were outside of the County's expectations;
 - Mr. Watkins stated the Clinton Transit's annual budget must be approved by MDOT on an annual basis, and as such, MDOT has the final say regarding the annual operating budget, specifically as it pertains to federal and state grant revenues;
- Deputy Administrator Campbell cautioned that at some point in the future the current Clinton Transit Board membership will change and may or may not be as focused and committed to moving the Clinton Transit forward as the current board causing concerns because with the proposed changes the Board of Commissioners will be reducing their current level of over-sight.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Commissioner Mitchell moved, seconded by Commissioner Washington, to **recommend** authorizing the proposed updates to Clinton Transit's Articles of Incorporation as presented. Motion carried.

BOARD ACTION: Commissioner DeLong moved, seconded by Commissioner Washington to concur with the committee recommendation. Motion carried.

WASTE MANAGEMENT
RURAL RECYCLING
ANNUAL REPORT

4. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong introduced Kate Neese, Waste Management Coordinator, to provide an annual report on the activities related to the rural recycling program.
 - The members reviewed the 2022 collection and cost data for the two rural recycling sites in Clinton County.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Commissioner Pohl moved, seconded by Commissioner Mitchell, to **recommend** accepting the annual report for the Clinton County Rural Recycling Program and place on file. Motion carried.

BOARD ACTION: Commissioner DeLong moved, seconded by Commissioner Mitchell to concur with the committee recommendation. Motion carried.

SHERIFF'S OFFICE –
INMATE COMMUNICATIONS
CONTRACT

- 4A. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong introduced Sheriff Dush and Undersheriff Gute to discuss the proposed inmate communications contract for the Sheriff's Office.
- Currently the Clinton County Sheriff's Office utilizes an outside vendor that provides for inmate communications which includes forms of communications such as telephone service along with usage of computer tablets;
 - Historically, across the country Correctional Facilities utilize a communications service provider, which allows incarcerated inmates the ability to contact friends and family by using the technology that these vendors offer; In return, the vendor offers a commission back to the County in the form of a percentage of revenue which is earned by the inmates paying for the use of these systems;
 - For over eight years there have been continuous issues with technical support from the current vendor in providing effective operation and there have been several repeated attempts to try and resolve many of these issues however, even to this day many of these issues remain constant and repetitive;
 - Due to these constant problems the Sheriff's Office began exploring additional options and vendors who offer these communication services to inmates being held in correctional facilities;
 - The Sheriff's Office contacted numerous other county agencies within Michigan and learned that most are using Combined Public Communications, LLC (CPC) as their vendor of choice for inmate communications; all these Sheriff's Offices had very positive reviews about both the effectiveness of the CPC system within their facility along with glowing reviews of CPC's commitment to both technical support and customer service;
 - Other county agencies reported a much higher amount of revenue coming from CPC than from their previous vendor; revenue is generated (and paid by inmate) for every call, text message and video visitation that is completed;
 - CPC offers newer technology and advancement in their communications system and offers many improvements that the Sheriff's Office does not currently have:
 - CPC offers an inmate video visitation module - allows inmates to have live communication with their family from their housing unit. This allows Corrections Officers the ability to not have the need to move inmates from their cell to a visitation area to meet with their family which increases both safety and security to our facility.
 - CPC offers a mail scan service which directs inmates mail to their facility which is then opened, scanned and the inmate is sent an image of their mail to their account. This greatly reduces the risk of narcotics and other substances entering the jail. This also allows Corrections Officers to not have the need to handle inmate mail which could expose them to potentially harmful substances and allows them to concentrate their work on other areas of the facility.

- CPC also offers other advanced technology products such as a text messaging feature called “Chirpers” that allow inmates the ability to instantly send text messages that will offer ways for inmates to remain in contact with family, which also helps reduce stress-related issues, mental health situations and provides a safer environment for Correctional Staff.
- It is the intention for this agreement to include all the above features in a 2-year contract with CPC.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Commissioner Pohl moved, seconded by Commissioner Vail-Shirey, to **recommend** approving the proposed agreement with Combined Public Communications, LLC (CPC) as the Sheriff’s Office vendor for all inmate communications and authorize the Clinton County Sheriff to sign all necessary documents. Motion carried.

BOARD ACTION: Commissioner DeLong moved, seconded by Commissioner Vail-Shirey to concur with the committee recommendation. Motion carried.

FACILITY AND FLEET SERVICES – CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT REQUESTS

MSUE PROJECT CONNECT REQUEST

5. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong introduced Rob Wooten, Facility and Fleet Services Director, to discuss the following requests:

- A.
- MSU Extension is hosting Project Connect events throughout the County in the month of August, including at the Fairgrounds on August 17th; the events will connect Clinton County individuals and families with supplies and resources to help families and kids prepare for the new school year;
 - One of the available resources will be a Sparrow Mobile Health Clinic which requires the County’s authorization of the “Use of Space for Mobile Health Clinic Agreement”;
 - The proposed agreement has been reviewed by the County’s legal counsel.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Commissioner Washington moved, seconded by Commissioner Pohl, to **recommend** authorizing the “Use of Space for Mobile Health Clinic Agreement” as presented. Motion carried.

BOARD ACTION: Commissioner DeLong moved, seconded by Commissioner Pohl to concur with the committee recommendation. Voting on the motion by roll call vote, those voting aye were DeLong, Washington, Mitchell, Vail-Shirey, Andrews, Pohl and Showers. Seven ayes and zero nays. Motion carried.

VEHICLE FUND BUDGET ADJUSTMENT

- B.
- Vehicle purchasing continues to be a problem; major manufacturers have not yet released 2024 model year government pricing, or solidified order window dates; it is expected that most, if not all, order windows for 2024 model year vehicles will be open for a very short period and will be closed well before January 1, 2024;
 - The 2024 model year vehicles that would traditionally be approved as part of the normal 2024 budget process, and ordered in early 2024, will need to be ordered in 2023 as the limited order windows open;
 - It is proposed that the 2023 budget be amended to include the 2024 model year vehicles; this will allow purchase orders to be issued and vehicles to be ordered in calendar year 2023, even though delivery will not be expected until 2024.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Commissioner Vail-Shirey moved, seconded by Commissioner Pohl, to **recommend** approving the following 2023 budget adjustments:

- 4 Sheriff's Office Patrol Vehicles - \$51,500 each (vehicle fund)
- Sheriff's Office Transport Van - \$42,000 (vehicle fund)
- Facility and Fleet Services Vehicle - \$50,000 (vehicle fund)
- Drain Commissioner's Office Truck - \$55,000

Motion carried.

BOARD ACTION: Commissioner DeLong moved, seconded by Commissioner Mitchell to concur with the committee recommendation. Voting on the motion by roll call vote, those voting aye were Andrews, Pohl, Vail-Shirey, DeLong, Mitchell, Washington and Showers. Seven ayes, zero nays. Motion carried.

PUBLIC SAFETY FACILITY
AND GREENHAVEN
REPLACEMENT STUDY
UPDATE

C.

- In May 2022, County Staff and Hobbs and Black Architects completed a Townsend Road Campus Master Plan including a Public Safety Facility Needs Study;
- Since these reports were completed, there has been turnover in many critical roles including Board of Commissioners Chairperson, Board of Commissioners members, Sheriff, Undersheriff, and County Administrator/Controller, as well as continuous societal and policy changes impacting all Courts and law enforcement agencies;
- Updating this Master Plan and Study will provide the County with accurate and current information on short-term and future facility needs allowing for effective long-term planning;
- The proposed updates will include:
 - Reviewing and updating the Public Safety Facility space programming
 - Updating and further developing the Public Safety Facility concept floor plan
 - Development of a Public Safety Facility Operational Plan
 - Updating Public Safety Facility construction cost estimates
 - Development of a space program for a future Youth Home facility replacement
 - Development of construction cost estimates for a future stand-alone Youth Home facility
 - Development of construction cost estimates for renovating the current Sheriff's Office/Jail facility into a Youth Home facility.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Commissioner Pohl moved, seconded by Commissioner Mitchell, to **recommend** approving up to \$40,000 for a Public Safety Facility and Greenhaven Replacement Study Update. Motion carried.

BOARD ACTION: Commissioner DeLong moved, seconded by Commissioner Pohl to concur with the committee recommendation. Voting on the motion by roll call vote, those voting aye were Pohl, Andrews, DeLong, Vail-Shirey, Washington, Mitchell and Showers. Seven ayes, zero nays. Motion carried.

COUNTY FAIRGROUNDS
UPDATE – DISCUSSION

- D.
- The members were notified that the small animal barn and covered arena have been determined to be unusable at the Fairgrounds due to noticeable deterioration of the support posts;
 - The County has been working with the 4-H Board and came up with a plan to rearrange the animals, and the County provide the funds to rent a tent that will be used in place of the covered arena;
 - No action is required at this time; however, the County will be requesting funds soon for the engineering services required to seek bids, to repair the two structures in 2024.

No action required.

ACCESS/POLICIES &
PROCEDURES FOR
CLINTON COUNTY
PROPERTIES

6. **REMOVED FROM AGENDA**

EMERGENCY
MANAGEMENT –
HOMELAND SECURITY
GRANT

7.

FIDUCIARY AGREEMENT
WITH INGHAM COUNTY

- A. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong introduced Tom Helms, Emergency Management Director, to discuss the Homeland Security Grant.
- This proposed agreement allows Clinton County to be a sub-recipient of the 2022 Homeland Security Grant Program; this federal grant is passed through the State and then to the Region 1 Homeland Security Planning Board;
 - Ingham County is currently the fiduciary agent for this grant;
 - The agreement outlines some of the conditions that the County must follow to be reimbursed; Clinton County has participated in this program since 2004.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Commissioner Mitchell moved, seconded by Commissioner Pohl, to **recommend** approving the FY 2022 HSGP Region 1 Board Sub-Recipient Agreement authorizing Ingham County to serve as the fiduciary for the region. Motion carried.

BOARD ACTION: Commissioner DeLong moved, seconded by Commissioner Mitchell to concur with the committee recommendation. Voting on the motion by roll call vote, those voting aye were Pohl, Mitchell, Washington, Vail-Shirey, DeLong, Andrews and Showers. Seven ayes, zero nays. Motion carried.

HOMELAND SECURITY
GRANT – FY 2022 PRE-
FUNDING REQUEST

- B. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong introduced Tom Helms, Emergency Management Director, to discuss pre-funding Clinton County's allocation of the 2022 Homeland Security Grant Program (HSGP) funds.
- Mr. Helms is asking for pre-funding of Clinton County's local share of the FY 2022 Region 1 Homeland Security Grant in the amount of \$64,906.24;
 - The members were provided with an outline of the proposed expenditures of the 2022 grant funds;
 - Grant funds must be used on projects that align with current state homeland security investment strategies, guidance and local threat and risk assessments;

- A portion of these funds must also be used for law enforcement terrorism prevention activities and five National Priorities as identified by the Department of Homeland Security;
- Commissioner Michell commended the Emergency Management Department for being proactive, efficient, and effective.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Commissioner Pohl moved, seconded by Commissioner Vail-Shirey, to **recommend** approving the pre-funding of Clinton County’s local share of the FY 2022 Homeland Security Grant (HSGP) funds in the amount of \$64,906.24. Motion carried.

BOARD ACTION: Commissioner DeLong moved, seconded by Commissioner Vail-Shirey to concur with the committee recommendation. Voting on the motion by roll call vote, those voting aye were Pohl, Mitchell, Washington, Vail-Shirey, DeLong, Andrews and Showers. Seven ayes, zero nays. Motion carried.

QUARTERLY BUDGET UPDATE

8. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson Stacey introduced Todd Campbell, Deputy Administrator, to provide the 2nd quarter budget update.
- Overall, the 2023 general fund continues to be on target for the approved budget;
 - Property tax and state revenue sharing continue to be the two main sources of revenue in the general fund;
 - Clinton County remains in sound financial condition and there are no budget adjustments for the 2nd quarter.

No action required.

AUGUST 2023 COMMITTEE MEETING CALENDAR

9. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong introduced discussion regarding the August 2023 Open Meetings and Events Calendar.
- The August 17th Ways and Means and HR Committee Meetings were removed from the calendar;
 - A Renewable Energy Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting was added on August 24th.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Commissioner Pohl moved, seconded by Commissioner Washington, to **recommend** approval of the August 2023 Open Meetings and Events Calendar as amended. Motion carried.

BOARD ACTION: Commissioner DeLong moved, seconded by Commissioner Vail-Shirey to concur with the committee recommendation. Motion carried.

ACCOUNTS PAYABLE INVOICES PAID TOTALS

10. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong introduced discussion regarding the accounts payable invoices paid.

COMMITTEE ACTION: Commissioner Washington moved, seconded by Commissioner Pohl, to approve the invoices paid from June 3 through July 7, 2023, in the amount of \$1,713,061.70. Motion carried.

COMMISSIONERS’ COMMENTS

11. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong requested Commissioners comments. There were none.

ADMINISTRATOR’S REPORT

12. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong requested the administrator’s report from Deputy Administrator Campbell.
- Deputy Administrator Campbell provided a bi-weekly update to the members regarding the construction of the Road Commission Facility;

- The members received a written quarterly report from the Lansing Economic Area Partnership (LEAP) in relation to LEAP’s economic development services contract with the County;
- Deputy Administrator Campbell provided an update on behalf of the Planning Commission; staff is working on obtaining a proposal from a consultant to bring to the Ways and Means Committee Meeting in August to assist the County in developing possible zoning ordinance text amendments;
- The members received an update regarding the July 4th event at Motz Park:
 - Ten families contacted the Parks Department and the Health Department regarding some family members becoming sick (gastro-intestinal) after attending the Park on the 4th of July; the families claimed people were sick from contact with the lake water;
 - The Parks Department conducts bi-weekly water samples as required by the State and the health department conducts weekly water samples; all samples are well below the 300 threshold;
 - Staff immediately contacted the health department so they could investigate; the health department was able to collect some stool samples from some of the infected families and the results tested positive for Norovirus; the Health Department has concluded that the lake water did not cause the illnesses and the water has been, and continues to be safe to swim in;
 - It was also noted that the bathroom facilities at Motz Park are cleaned four times per day.

ADJOURNMENT OF
COMMITTEE MEETING

13. Ways and Means Committee Chairperson DeLong adjourned the meeting at 9:58 a.m.

**HUMAN RESOURCES
COMMITTEE MEETING**

Commissioner Vail-Shirey, Chairperson of the Human Resources Committee, reported on a meeting held July 20, 2023.

ATTENDANCE AT
COMMITTEE MEETING

Members Present:
Val Vail-Shirey, Chairperson
Bruce DeLong
Dwight Washington
David Pohl
John Andrews
Ken Mitchell
Robert Showers, Ex-Officio Member

Staff Present:
Todd Campbell Sherry Loynes
Penny Goerge Nikki Maneval
Cindy Moser Tina Weber
Terri Paradise Theresa Nelson
Debi Price Erica Denman
Rob Wooten Deb Sutherland
Chris Collom

CALL TO ORDER/ APPROVE
OF AGENDA

1. Human Resources Committee Chairperson Vail-Shirey called the meeting to order at 10:03 a.m. Commissioner DeLong moved, seconded by Commissioner Washington, to approve the amended agenda as posted. Motion carried.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

2. Human Resources Committee Chairperson Vail-Shirey requested limited public comments. There were none.

EMPLOYEE AND EMPLOYER
DELEGATES TO MERS
ANNUAL MEETING

3. Human Resources Committee Chairperson Vail-Shirey introduced discussion regarding the appointment of the employee and employer delegates to the 2023 MERS Annual Meeting that is taking place September 28-29 at the Renaissance Center in Detroit.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Commissioner DeLong moved, seconded by Commissioner Pohl, to **recommend** the approval of Jon Morrison as the employee delegate, and Cindy Moser as the alternate to the 2023 MERS Annual Meeting, as selected by secret ballot. Motion carried.

BOARD ACTION: Commissioner Vail-Shirey moved, seconded by Commissioner Mitchell to concur with the committee recommendation. Motion carried.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Commissioner DeLong moved, seconded by Commissioner Pohl, to **recommend** the appointment of John Fuentes as the officer representative, and Todd Campbell as the alternate officer representative to the 2023 MERS Annual Meeting. Motion carried.

BOARD ACTION: Commissioner Vail-Shirey moved, seconded by Commissioner Pohl to concur with the committee recommendation. Motion carried.

CENTRAL DISPATCH

4. Human Resources Committee Chairperson Vail-Shirey introduced discussion regarding a personnel request from Central Dispatch.
- Director Collom apologized for the late receipt of agenda materials, and informed the members she did not have the proposed letter of agreement facilitated until late yesterday;
 - Director Collom briefly discussed the recent hiring and retention challenges that her department is experiencing:
 - Staffing crisis - The Department is currently operating at only 60% and unable to meet minimum staffing requirements with two Telecommunicators per shift;
 - Although the represented employees' CBA was ratified in early 2022, the neighboring counties and comparable counties have made significant increases for retention and recruitment efforts since the CBA was ratified;
 - Managerial staff responsibilities have increased with additional tasks and expectations that would typically be done by lead telecommunicators per their job description;
 - The median pay scale for comparable and neighboring counties is higher;
 - Clinton County is unable to compete in retaining and attracting local talent;
 - Director Collom explained there is a nationwide shortage for Telecommunicators due to mental and physical health issues, mandatory overtime, staffing shortages, rotating shifts on nights and days, low pay, and benefits; it was further noted this is a high stress work environment that requires the ability to handle emergency situations, communicate effectively and multi-task efficiently;
 - Ms. Collom provided an overview of the training program; Central Dispatch has had to lower testing standards to provide more applicant choices; the added stress on the trainers is very apparent and the program is suffering due to the high stress and limited one-on-one time to focus on training;
 - Due to these ongoing challenges, Director Collom is seeking support and approval for an incentive and referral agreement for the represented and non-represented employees in 911;

- The proposed Letter of Agreement adjusts the starting wage to \$20.00 per hour (with 3% annual increases) and offers quarterly retention stipends to 911 employees based on their status; probationary employees will receive \$250 per quarter and non-probationary employees will receive \$1,200 per quarter through the end of the current CBA that runs through December 31, 2025;
- In addition, the proposed Letter of Agreement offers a referral incentive in the amount of \$500 to a Department employee who refers a candidate for employment with the Department that is hired and successfully completes their training period;
- Administrator Fuentes and Director Collom have confirmed there are sufficient funds in the 911 Fund fund balance for this request; it was emphasized that the 911 Fund is completely independent of the general fund, therefore no general fund dollars will be expended;
- Administration supports this extraordinary measure given the current inability to attract qualified applicants, the high percentage of applicants unable to successfully complete the training program, and the retention of trained employees, as the goal is to improve 911's ability to ensure the County remains able to provide the level of service that is expected of Central Dispatch.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Commissioner Pohl moved, seconded by Commissioner Mitchell, to **recommend** approving the Letter of Agreement regarding employee recruitment and retention with TPOAM (representing the Clinton County 911 Telecommunicators) and to provide unrepresented, non-exempt 911 employees to receive the same retention stipend benefits as presented in the TPOAM Letter of Agreement. Motion carried.

BOARD ACTION: Commissioner Vail-Shirey moved, seconded by Commissioner Mitchell to concur with the committee recommendation. Voting on the motion by roll call vote, those voting aye were Mitchell, Pohl, Vail-Shirey, DeLong, Andrews, Washington and Showers. Seven ayes, zero nays. Motion carried.

PERSONNEL – ONE-TIME
EMPLOYEE RETENTION
INCENTIVE

5. Human Resources Committee Chairperson Vail-Shirey introduced discussion regarding a personnel request from Administration.
 - Administration is recommending the Board adopt a one-time retention benefit for unrepresented employees outside the Prosecutor's Office and the 911 Department, such offices having already been the subject of specific recruitment and retention benefit recommendations and actions;
 - The remaining unrepresented employees would receive a one-time retention benefit as follows: \$2,500, payable 50% upon Board approval and 50% six months from date of approval as a non-pension benefit payment, subject to standard taxes and withholdings; part-time employees would receive this incentive at a pro-rated amount;
 - Deputy Administrator Campbell noted there are enough dollars in the general fund to cover this request; the total approximate cost is \$440,000 with 50% to be paid in 2023 and 50% to be paid in 2024;
 - Administration will also be working with the collective bargaining units in the Sheriff's Office to offer the same one-time retention benefit;
 - Discussion followed and the county employees were recognized for their hard work and dedication to Clinton County.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Commissioner DeLong moved, seconded by Commissioner Andrews, to **recommend** approving the one-time employee retention benefit offering to unrepresented employees (excluding 911 Department and Prosecutor's Office) in the amount of \$2,500, payable 50% upon Board approval and 50% six months from date of approval as a non-pension benefit payment, subject to standard taxes and withholdings. Part-time employees will receive this incentive at a pro-rated amount. Motion carried unanimously.

BOARD ACTION: Committee Vail-Shirey moved, seconded by Commissioner Andrews to concur with the committee recommendation. Voting on the motion by roll call vote, those voting aye were Washington, Vail-Shirey, Andrews, Pohl, Mitchell, DeLong and Showers. Seven ayes, zero nays. Motion carried.

ADMINISTRATOR'S REPORT

6. Human Resources Committee Chairperson Vail-Shirey requested the administrator's report. There was no report given.

COMMISSIONERS' COMMENTS

7. Human Resources Committee Chairperson Vail-Shirey requested Commissioners' Comments.

- Commissioner Delong notified the members that Clinton County Catalyst has a new Director, Tim Fair;
- Commissioner Vail-Shirey provided an update on behalf of the Clinton County Planning Commission's Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting;
- Commissioner Showers:
 - Briefly discussed Clinton County Catalyst;
 - Notified the members that a meeting took place with the Mayor of St. Johns to encourage them to work with Bingham Township to form a Utilities Authority;
 - Provided an update on behalf of the Tri-County Regional Planning Commission;
 - Discussed potential economic developments in the City of East Lansing and Bath Township.

ADJOURNMENT OF COMMITTEE MEETING

8. Human Resources Committee Chairperson Vail-Shirey adjourned the meeting at 10:40 a.m.

PUBLIC SAFETY COMMITTEE MEETING

Commissioner Mitchell, Chairperson of the Public Safety Committee, reported on a meeting held July 20, 2023.

ATTENDANCE AT COMMITTEE MEETING

Members Present:
Ken Mitchell, Public Safety Chairperson
Val Vail-Shirey
John Andrews
Dwight Washington
Bruce DeLong
David Pohl

Members Excused:
Robert Showers, Ex-Officio Member

Staff Present
Todd Campbell
Penny Goerge
Jennifer Richards
Dan Gibson
Cindy Moser

Others Present

Sheri Mandeville, Department of Health and Human Services (DHHS)
Rebekah Anderson, Department of Health and Human Services (DHHS)
Stacy Houghtaling, Department of Health and Human Services (DHHS)

CALL TO ORDER/APPROVAL
OF AGENDA

1. Chairperson Mitchell called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m. Commissioner Pohl moved, seconded by Commissioner DeLong, to approve the agenda. Motion carried.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

2. Chairperson Mitchell requested limited public comments. There were no public comments.

CHILD CARE FUND
OVERVIEW

3. Chairperson Mitchell introduced Todd Campbell, Deputy Administrator to discuss the Child Care Fund Budget.
 - A budget summary showing the status of the childcare fund was provided;
 - Deputy Administrator Campbell noted that the budget for state wards is under budget while the budget for court wards is trending to be over budget; however, the Child Care Fund overall is currently within the budget.

No action required.

DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH
AND HUMAN SERVICES –
CHILD CARE FUND UPDATE

4. Chairperson Mitchell introduced Stacy Houghtaling, Rebekah Anderson and Sheri Mandeville from DHHS to discuss the Child Care Fund.
 - Stacy Houghtaling provided an update on the status of the childcare fund and discussion followed regarding treatment and programming services;
 - The members were notified there is still a strong need for foster families in the community;
 - Commissioner Washington asked for clarification regarding the discrepancy in monthly placement costs; it was explained that the more costly placements are due to that child having to be placed in a childcare institution, rather than foster care;
 - Discussion took place regarding Medicaid redeterminations; DHHS is strongly committed to ensuring people who are eligible for Medicaid coverage remain enrolled; monthly renewal notices are being sent three months prior to a beneficiaries' renewal date starting with June renewal dates.

No action required.

JUVENILE COURT – CHILD
CARE FUND UPDATE

5. Chairperson Mitchell introduced Jennifer Richards, Manager of Juvenile Court and Juvenile Services, and Dan Gibson, Juvenile Facilities Manager to provide an update on behalf of the Child Care Fund.
 - Juvenile Facilities Manager Gibson provided information to the members regarding juvenile programming and treatment; data was provided regarding caseloads and trends for the first two quarters of this year; it was noted that Green Haven usage has gone down slightly;
 - Juvenile Courts and Services Manager Richards discussed the childcare fund; data was presented for the in-home care services provided and discussion took place regarding the number of youths that have resided at Green Haven for either secure detention or residential care in the open setting;
 - There is still a critical shortage of juvenile beds in Michigan; Ms. Richards reported there is a detention facility opening in Ewart that will add another option for secured detention, however it will likely fill up quickly;

- Ms. Richards notified the members that a recent audit of the childcare fund may have an effect on childcare reimbursements; reimbursements are now based on actual hours rather than percentage of time;
- The members received an update regarding Juvenile Justice Reform; the state budget authorized at least \$3.1 million for the Child Care Fund raised to 75% reimbursement for community and evidence-based services; legislative changes will still need to be made, but the task force is working on language which will include no longer limiting the funds to intensive in-home services;
- Ms. Richards provided a status update regarding the various community service programs that she facilitates in her department with community organizations; Commissioner Washington asked Ms. Richards to contact the Parks and Recreation Department to discuss additional programming opportunities.

No action required.

COMMISSIONERS' COMMENTS

6. Chairperson Mitchell requested Commissioners' comments. There were none.

ADJOURNMENT OF COMMITTEE MEETING

7. Chairperson Mitchell adjourned the meeting at 8:54 a.m.

END OF COMMITTEE REPORTS

COMMISSIONERS' COMMENTS

Chairperson Showers called for Commissioners' comments.

- Commissioner Mitchell reported on the NACO Conference that he and Commissioner Washington attended in Texas. He spoke of the benefits of networking and noted that the same issues and challenges are being faced across the country.
- Commissioner Washington agreed with Commissioner Mitchell's comments. He spoke of the heat while attending, the recognition of climate change issues by the public health community, the benefits of electric vehicles to mitigate some of the carbon and the possibility of federal government funding down the road.
- Commissioner Vail-Shirey reported:
 - At Mr. Boling's request for follow up by the Commissioners representing Victor Township and Bath Township, she made 8 visits and recordings in front of Mr. Boling's home and in front of the other property he referenced. The recordings will be turned over to Administrator/Controller Fuentes. She has also had some follow up discussions with the Victor Township Supervisor and with Commissioner Washington.
 - The Citizens Advisory Committee is making progress and will begin discussions on the ordinances in August. They will have the report to the Planning Commission by September 14th.

ADJOURNMENT

BOARD ACTION: With no further business to come before the Board, Chairperson Showers adjourned the meeting at 9:40 a.m.

Debra A. Sutherland

Debra A. Sutherland, Clerk of the Board

NOTE: These minutes are subject to approval on August 29, 2023.